

---

## Appendix A

---

### Analysis of Scoping Comments

#### NPT Culvert Replacement Project

Three letters specific to the project were received during the scoping period of December 17, 2015 to January 29, 2016. The letters were analyzed and an analysis code assigned to the comments (see Table 1).

#### Comment Analysis Codes

- 1: Outside the scope of the proposed action.
- 2: Already decided by law, regulation, Forest Plan, or other higher level of decision.
- 3: Irrelevant to the decision to be made.
- 4: Conjectural and not supported by scientific evidence.
- 5: General comment, suggestion, opinion, or position statement.
- 6: Other agency or partner's consultation, review, advice, recommendation(s), etc.
- 7: Already considered in the proposed action or is standard procedure.

Codes 1 – 6 are standard codes. Comments assigned to these codes are considered to be non-significant issues. Code 7 was added as a category for those suggestions that are already proposed or for procedures that are routinely done.

**Table 1: Comment Analysis**

Commenter	Comment	Disposition
Gary Mcfarlane Friends of the Clearwater	This proposal seems to be beneficial and may fit within CE parameters. However, the agency needs to publish the monitoring results of past similar projects to make certain that negative impacts truly fit within a CE.	2, 5
	[T]he plethora of roads in the area and the fact that the Forest Service has not done a proper minimum-roads analysis suggests a true minimum road system needs to be a priority ... a minimum road system would lessen the need for many smaller projects like this...	1, 5
Brad Smith, Idaho Conservation League	We encourage the Forest Service to conduct a travel analysis in the project area and evaluate whether or not these roads or any other roads are no longer needed for access or future management.	1, 5, 7
	Although fish passage may be improved or provided by ... passable road crossing structures, road removal (i.e. decommissioning and obliteration) is a more ideal solution. Removing unneeded roads ... will result in even greater improvements in water quality and habitat.	1, 5
Bernie Hermann Lewis-Clark ATV Club Inc.	The Lewis-Clark ATV Club Inc. supports the project.	Thank you for your comment.